A critical Discourse Analysis of The News Headlines of Budget of Pakistan FY 2011-2012

Muhammad Asim Mahmood (Corresponding author)
Saira Javed
Rashid Mahmood
Govt. College University Faisalabad, Pakistan.

Abstract
This study is a critical Discourse Analysis of news headlines of different papers about budget 2011-2012 of Pakistan. 37 different headlines from local English papers, local Urdu papers and international English papers were randomly selected and grouped in the surface structure classification. This study observed the representation of a single news item of budget 2011-2012 in different papers in their own ideological perspectives. The local papers aim to represent the news to evoke readers’ emotions on a certain issue, but the news produced for foreign readers in the national papers highlight the news of certain foreign policy which may protect the country from enemies. The study concludes that headlines are representations of the editors’ ideologies regarding their political inclinations though they claim to give purely neutral information.

Keywords: Budget, News, Headlines, Ideology, Politics, Inclination.

1. Introduction
CDA is a field of study which has paved the ways for the linguists to find out the hidden ideologies behind seemingly simple and plain words. Language is no longer seen as merely reflecting out reality, but as central to creating reality (Taiwo 2007). News papers play a vital role in depicting social issues according to their own ideology. News papers are particularly known to lead in the initiation of discourse on the national issues by picking on statements or reactions of prominent national figures (ibid). News Headlines are the greatest source of providing information to all, especially to people who are too busy to read the whole of the news articles or stories. These headlines are description of social, cultural and national representations circulating in a society at a specific time. The following study analyzes the differences of the various headlines with their respective ideologies.

2. Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA)
CDA aims at making the connections transparent among discourse practices, social practices and social structures, connections that might be opaque to the layperson (Sheyholislami 2001). Luke (as cited in Taiwo 2007) describes that CDA is a method of DA that reveals hidden ideas behind everyday discussion. Language
is no longer seen as merely reflecting outer reality. Fiske (1994) says that our words are never neutral they
carry power that reflects interest of speakers. The objective of CDA is to uncover the ideologies or
assumptions that are hidden behind the words of our written texts or oral speech.

3. CDA of Media (Newspapers)

Media is an important discourse domain to which CDA has been applied. There are different researches being
carried out on media discourse as Dijk (1991) has worked on the roles of news reports in ethnic relation,
McGregor (2003) has worked on the role of news reports on dominant forces of society, and Kress (1990) has
-described the adoption of particular ideological discursive structure in ideological system. The press study is
confronting with the time consuming nature of CDA which makes it difficult to analyze the long articles
(Develootte & Rechneiwski 2001).

Newspapers play a leading role in creating discourse on the statements of national and international prominent
politicians. Newspaper editors try to build up the ideologies of what is talked about and in which manner
(Henry & Tentor 2002 as cited in Taiwo). “Ideology is used in many disciplines with different, but
overlapping shades of meaning” (ibid p.221). Hence newspapers are a source of power imposition in a
society. Not only the news stories work for forming ideologies but headlines are a great source of attraction
for the readers. According to Sheyholislami (2001) themes and topics are realized in the headlines and lead
paragraphs.

Dijk (1998) is of the view that headlines depict the unity of discourse and are a source of information which is
easily memorized by the reader. He claims that the readers having their own beliefs and ideas generally
“adopt these subjective media definitions of what is important information about an event.”(p.248). The aim
of CDA is to find out the hidden meanings in the discourse of newspapers. There are certain dispositions used
in the language which are closely related to the social positions of the users. According to Kress (1990) the
defined statements themselves express and are organized by a specific ideology. Newspapers headlines act as
forerunner to news reports.

4. Newspapers Headlines

Headlines expose the social, cultural and national representations. Headlines are considered by the audience
more than the news articles. Their impact is likely to be more upon the readers due to certain linguistic
features which make them memorable and effective (Develotee & Rechniewski 2001). The editors according
to Taiwo (2004) use the news headlines to evoke the readers by using eye catching phrases, emotive
vocabulary and rhetorical and graphological devices. Claude (1980) as cited in Develotee & Rechneiwski
(2001) states that newspaper headlines not only put the content in a nutshell but the orientation and perspective of the readers as well. There are certain presuppositions in the headlines which are expected from the reader to understand and any person who is not familiar with the field of cultural references will not be able to decode the messages in them.

Taiwo (2007) has classified news headlines in thematic and surface structures. Themes may vary from one another like religious crises, on different issues, on politics, on education, on labour matters. He classifies headlines into surface structure as plain headlines, speech as headlines, with pointer and question as headlines. There are certain linguistic features of newspaper headlines. As Develotee & Rechneiwski (2001) state that Mardh (1980) offers an exhaustive study of the characteristic features of the headlines of English newspapers. The omission of articles, verbs, & auxiliaries, nominalizations, adverbial headlines, usage of short words, use of alliteration are certain features pointed out by him.

There are various linguistic devices used in news headlines as Olowe (1993) has identified, to form ideologies in a hidden way. These devices are thematicization, passivization, presupposition and nominalization. In Presupposition (Huckin 1997) certain ideas are taken for granted in such a way that there was no alternative. Topicalization (MCGregor 2003) is the framing of a sentence. It presents the slant or perspective a writer wants to present in order to influence the reader’s perception by putting something on topic position. Agency refers to the agents involved in some action. Headlines can also convey information about power relations, who is given the charge etc but sometimes this agency is being deleted in order to avoid the responsibility of saying something. Here passivization is being used with deletion of the agency being involved in certain action or saying.

5. **Methodology**

The data for this study has been collected from different Urdu and English national as well as international newspapers. 16 local news headlines of English papers & 15 local news headlines of Urdu papers, while 05 international news headlines in English on budget 2011-2012 Pakistan have been collected. The rationale for this research is to find out the different representations of a same budget speech made by the finance minister in different newspapers. It would explore the different perspectives of different newspapers with some political affiliations. This CDA analysis describes the way in which a same news is represented before the natives and the foreigners. First of all the headlines are grouped regarding their surface structure. Then with the help of certain CDA devices the results are drawn.
6. Data Analysis & Discussion

6.1 Surface structure classification of News headlines

6.1.1. Plain Headlines

All these headlines are simple statements which are describing the budget news in a simple way. But there are some hidden ideologies even in these headlines. Apparently these seem to be neutral but CDA will disclose all these hidden ideologies.

In the collected data following headlines worked as plain headlines but in all the headlines of English local papers there was a single word being presented at topolized position i.e. defence.

- Pakistan jacks up annual defence spending {3 June 2011, All Voices}
- Pakistan's government jacked up defence spending and government employees' pensions in a new budget on Friday that set a deficit of four percent of GDP. {3 June 2011, IPOT news}
- Govt for checks and balances on defence spending {5 June 2011, Pakistan Link 2}
- Pakistan jacks up annual defence spending to Rs 495 bn. {4 June 2011, The Economic Times}
- Budget 2011-2012: Defence spending up 12% {4 June 2011, International Herald Tribune}

While in all the urdu paper headlines the word salary (tankhahein) is being topicalized e.g.

- Tankhwahon me 15, pension me 20% tak izafa, cheeni, mashrubat, adwiat, seemant, shampoo sasty {5 June 211, Express} [upto 15% increase in salaries, 20% increase in pensions, the prices of sugar, soft drinks, medicines and cement came down]
- Tankhahon me izafa, taxon me kami, bijli, khad per subsidy khatam {5 June 2011, Waqt} [increase in salaries and reduction in taxe, subsidy on electricity and fertilizers removed]
- Tankahon, pension me izafa, cheeni, cigarette, adwiat mehngi {4 June 2011, aaj} [increase in salaries, pensions. Prices of sugar, cigarette, medicine went up]
- Tankahon, pension me izafa, cigarette, amarti saman mehnga, khany peeny ki ashia sasti {4 June 2011, osaaf} [increase in salaries, pensions...prices of cigarette, building materials went up...while prices of edibles came down.]

This is presenting a great difference between these bilingual news headlines. Here lies the ideology of the news editors. In English newspapers which are meant for the foreigners to read the news being presented is
that of defence spending. This is meant for the nationalistic aspect through which the nationalists want to highlight this positive aspect of the budget 2011. As recently the event of OBL (Osama Bin Laden) killing in Pakistan has left many questions unanswered regarding the defence strategy of Pakistan, so editors have preferred this news for the foreign countries to be aware of this aspect. While on the other hand the local newspapers in the native language are meant for the local readers who are suffering from inflation and this is a good news for them that the new budget will bring an increment in their salaries. The preferences of the editors are having some ideology with them which is justified by the CDA analysis.

6.1.2. Speech as Headlines
This type of headlines use either direct or reported speech of a person and the name is also shown in front of the statement. Here the headlines are given through which

- Babar Awan terms budget 2011-12 balanced, people friendly {4 june 2011 Associated press}
- WCCI lauds budget 2011-12 {5 june 2011, business recorder}
- Economic Advisory Council(EAC) terms budget strategy ‘anti-poor’.{4 june 2011 columns pk}
- Traders term budget 2011-12 murky {4 June 2011, The Daily Times}

6.1.3. Headlines with pointers
These type of headlines have such elements in them which make the readers aware of the comments. There are two parts of the headlines i.e. the given information which is followed by a comment. In the following headlines different perspectives are being represented which also depict the political inclinations of different newspapers by the Critical Discourse Analysis.

- Budget widely hailed
- “pro-poor” budget rejected by the poor
- Federal budget termed unbalanced
- Budget or Amrici ghumali namunzur(pml-N) {4 June 2011, Nawaiwqt} [budget and American slavery is unacceptable]
- naya budget syasi samjota hy, ghurbat or berozgari khatam nahi ho gi (4 june 2011, Experts) [new budget is political compromise, poverty and unemployment will not end]
- ‘UNSURPRISINGLY, the federal budget presented by Finance minister has impressed few’. {4 june 2011, The Dawn}
- Pakistani budget seen lackluster (4 June 2011, The wallstreet Journal)
6.1.4. Question as Headlines

The headlines, which are in form of questions, come under the heading of interrogative headlines. The purpose of these headlines is to arouse the feelings of the readers towards an issue. These headlines evoke the viewers to boycott some issue or some political decision. The CDA analysis of the following headlines is depicting the ideologies of the editors who want to draw the attention of the public towards some question which is left unanswered. This is left upon the readers to think and answer if the budget is useful for them or not? It is asked by the readers if this is a friendly budget or what name would they give to this budget. Hence the readers are invoked to arise some boycott by thinking of the benefits and drawbacks of this budget. Different editors are giving their own ideologies in a different way

- Budget: targeting the impossible? {5 June 2011, international the News}
- Naya budget awam dost ya.....{4 June 2011, Jang} [new budget public friendly or...]
- Kya ye awami budget hey? {5 June 2011, Jang} [Is it a public budget?]

6.2. Linguistic features of headlines in presenting ideologies

There are certain linguistic features of these headlines of budget news which are depicting the ideologies of the different newspapers.

Topicalization is one important feature of the news headlines which has depicted the very nature of different ideologies presented by the editors. It resulted as the newspapers which are to be read by foreigners depict the news related to the defence and the papers meant for the local readers topicalized the common issue of inflation.

Evaluations and judgments are also an important feature of news headlines which depict the slant of the editor. As news is created upon the speeches of the politicians, hence the editors select the news which may create sensational feelings in the readers. The main concern of CDA analysis here is to find out the way of presenting those speeches and explore which paper is presenting which news. One news is depicted in two different ways, one whose interests are bein served and the other whose interest are marred.

Here is the representation of evaluation of budget in two most circular newspapers of Pakistan. The difference between the representations is
Naya budget syasi samjota hy, ghurbat or berozgari khatam nahi ho gi (Experts) (5 June 2011, Jang)
[new budget is political compromise, poverty and unemployment will not end]

The newspaper which is somewhat inclined towards the govt. is presenting the govt point of view, which a positive evaluation of budget. Here it serves for the continuity of the policy. On the other hand Jang newspaper which is against the govt policies is presenting the evaluation given by experts and that is a negative evaluation of the Budget which aims at changing the policies being adopted. Here lies the hidden ideology of the newspaper editors who are presenting certain evaluations in their papers which are likely to evoke the emotions of the readers.

Sensationalism is sometimes carried to such extent as it reveals writer’s angle of judgment to a particular issue. Sometimes the editors use graphological devices to represent their evaluations. The usage of bolt or upper case depicts these ideologies e.g.

- **UNSURPRISINGLY, the federal budget presented by Finance minister has impressed few’ (4 June 2011, Dawn)**

  The usage of uppercase shows that the writer wanted to highlight that it is not surprising that budget has impressed few, as there are certain parties who are in favour of this budget & it was already accepted by them. Usage of ‘few’ is presupposition as it is expected from the readers to know these ‘few’, who are happy with it.

  The editor uses the bolt and uppercase as he wants his readers to see the issue in the way he has presented it. The readers are meant to revolutionize their thoughts.

  The judgment of an international paper also keep importance for the foreign readers. The representation of the same news in the foreign paper depict the ideology of the foreigners about some other country. Here is a stance of a US paper which is most widely circulated.

- **Hit by floods & militancy, Pakistan aims to collect more tax to help revive battered economy (3 June 2011, the Washington Post)**

  It looks as in future Pakistan aims at collecting more taxes but the same point is rejected by another American paper which is depicted in Pakistani newspaper *Jang* as

- **Pakistan me ameer tabqa dunya bhar me sab se kam tax ada kerta hay ( American Paper) (5 June 2011, Jang) [in Pakistan, the rich class pays the lowest tax amount all over the world]**
Here lies the opinion of the foreign paper about Pakistan and her economy. This is described as battered economy, where tax is not paid by the rich. This notorious picture of a country about another country depicts the views of that country. Hence US thinks Pakistan as a poor country and is mocking at its budget policy through which it wants to collect more taxes which is not attainable by her.

Agency is lacking in most of news. Passivization is an important feature of headlines as the agency deletion becomes easy for the editor who doesn’t want to show the person responsible for the comment which follows.

- Federal budget termed unbalanced

- Budget widely hailed {5 June 2011, Pakistan Observer}

- Pakistani budget seen lackluster {5 June 2011, The wallstreet Journal}

In all of the above news headlines agency is being deleted in order to hide the responsibility of the agent of evaluating the budget. This budget is termed as unbalanced but who terms it so is unknown to the readers. The emphasis is given to the evaluation as it is expected from the readers to evaluate in the same way. Then the headline of the international paper too is lacking agency that is seeing this budget as lackluster. Just the viewpoint is highlighted in order to make the readers aware of Pakistani budget which is devalued.

The ideology of the editors is also depicted by the adjectives being use for the budget 2011-2012. Firstly it is said to be Murky lackluster and unbalanced. All these adjectives depict it in a negative way. Then some of the papers which have used positive adjectives for the budget, as their slant is towards the govt. and they are terming it positive and helpful for the people. Gharib nawaz, pro poor etc. are some of the terms used by the govt. friendly persons.

Information is the key aspect of the news headlines. Hence the info being given after the budget speech of the finance minister, is related to different percentages of increase in salaries and prices as well. The front page headlines of the most circular newspapers contained the figurative information regarding this very budget e.g.

- Pakistani Govt. presented 2.767 trn budget for 2011-212 {4 June 2011 Pak Tribune}

- Pakistan jacks up annual defence spending to Rs.495 bn (economic Times)

- Defence spending up12%( 4 June 2011, International Herald Tribune)
In order to give more facts and be true to the news these direct information are presented. To catch the attention of the readers more figurative language is used.

7. Conclusion

This study has observed how ideology works in the construction of newspaper headlines. Working within the discipline of Critical Discourse Analysis, our findings have depicted that the newspaper headlines not only have general rhetorical and graphological features but there are also certain hidden ideologies of the editors behind the apparently simple statements. Editors of the local newspapers present the news which is meant for the common and the national readers like the social issues. These are presented in a way to inform the uninformed readers. While in English newspapers those items are presented which are meant for the foreigners and on a nationalistic level it is required to make others know the strategies of defence and look before keeping a bad eye on the country. Certain opinions and evaluations are also represented in the news headlines. But the selection of these speech headlines depicts the political inclinations of the editors, who select either those speeches which may make readers annoyed towards certain leader, or those which may shape the thinking of the readers as the editors want them to perceive. On some occasions all newspapers have reflected the same views of society. This can be concluded that a single news is presented in different papers in different perspectives keeping their political inclinations in view. CDA has laid all these ideologies transparent which were opaque for a common reader.
References


